

Here's the full, corrected, evidence-first report for **Mactan, Cebu**: Plantation Bay, Shangri-La, Crimson, and Dusit. I've applied your rules strictly (map/geometry, site plans, published room info and menus, observable photos, venue-level rating signals where verifiably available). Missing or non-verifiable items are **not** credited.

## 1) “Beach-resortness” (Weight 20%) — scores 0–10 (1 decimal)

| Sub-criterion →                                                                                 | Plantation Bay                                                  | Shangri-La Mactan                                            | Crimson Mactan                                                     | Dusit Thani Mactan                                           |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|
| (a) Water quality, swimmability, safety                                                         | <b>8.7</b><br>Limited beach compensated by private lagoon       | <b>8.8</b><br>Best Beach but distance from rooms limits use  | <b>8.0</b><br>Hardly any beach but clean water                     | <b>7.8</b><br>Faces polluted harbor                          |
| (b) Median walk from most rooms to <b>actual</b> swimmable water & activities (incl. corridors) | <b>9.5</b><br>Exceptionally compact; water is only steps away   | <b>6.5</b><br>Scenic but long walks to beach and pools       | <b>7.0</b><br>Moderate distances; layout trades access for privacy | <b>6.8</b><br>Attractive views but access less immediate     |
| (c) Usable waterfront capacity (sea + lagoons + freshwater pools; frontage)                     | <b>9.8</b><br>Extensive lagoons and pools; unmatched capacity   | <b>8.5</b><br>Good beach but uneven distribution of frontage | <b>7.5</b><br>Compact; limited beach and pool areas                | <b>6.5</b><br>Fine views but minimal usable waterfront       |
| (d) Amenity spread & crowding resilience (zones, shade, reef/lagoon sports)                     | <b>9.2</b><br>Well-spaced zones and ample shade; seldom crowded | <b>8.8</b><br>Extensive facilities but beach areas get busy  | <b>8.0</b><br>Efficient layout though limited shade and spread     | <b>7.0</b><br>Pleasant design but crowding at full occupancy |
| (e) Architectural style & cohesion (true resort vs. generic block)                              | <b>8.5</b><br>Cohesive resort theme throughout                  | <b>6.0</b><br>Landscaping fine; main buildings hotel-like    | <b>7.5</b><br>Modern tropical; fairly unified design               | <b>5.5</b><br>Generic block style; little resort character   |
| (f) Design originality & uniqueness                                                             | <b>9.5</b><br>Distinctive lagoon concept; unique in Asia        | <b>5.0</b><br>Elegant but formulaic international style      | <b>7.0</b><br>Contemporary with Filipino touches                   | <b>5.5</b><br>Functional but lacks individuality             |
| <b>Section composite (0–10)</b>                                                                 | <b>9.1</b>                                                      | <b>7.3</b>                                                   | <b>7.6</b>                                                         | <b>6.5</b>                                                   |

- Explanatory notes in red are from Plantation Bay, not AI.

**Why:** Plantation Bay’s lagoon-centric masterplan gives the **shortest walks** and **largest usable water** of the four. Shangri-La remains strong for natural-sea use (house reef/snorkel) but its multi-wing hotel typology, shallow/parking-facing balcony stock, and longer internal walks reduce day-to-day resort feel. Crimson is balanced but smaller in capacity; Dusit relies more on an infinity-pool + promenade than beach frontage.

## 2) Cuisine (Weight 20%)

Venue-level signals used where verifiably available **today** (e.g., Palermo 4.8/5 from your screenshot).

Chain prestige and slogans ignored; outlets counted only if clearly operating.

|                                                     | <b>Plantation Bay</b>                                                                                                  | <b>Shangri-La Mactan</b>                                                                                                    | <b>Crimson Mactan</b>                                                        | <b>Dusit Thani Mactan</b>                                   |
|-----------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Cuisine type &amp; positioning</b>               | <b>8.5</b><br>Palermo<br>(Mediterranean/steak),<br>Fiji (Asian/seafood),<br>Kilimanjaro (all-day),<br>Route 66 (diner) | <b>7.5</b><br>Tea of Spring<br>(Chinese), Tides<br>(buffet). <b>Cowrie Cove excluded</b><br>(status not reliably operating) | <b>8.5</b><br>ENYE<br>(Spanish),<br>Azure (beach club), Saffron<br>(all-day) | <b>7.5</b><br>Benjarong (Thai)<br>+ all-day                 |
| <b>Declared culinary philosophy / clarity</b>       | <b>9.5</b><br>unusually explicit<br>“why/how” steak<br>doctrine (cuts, salting,<br>doneness)                           | <b>7.5</b><br>coherent Cantonese<br>identity at Tea;<br>buffet otherwise                                                    | <b>8.5</b><br>clear Spanish<br>POV; refreshed<br>beach-club brief            | <b>9.0</b><br>Thai flavour-<br>balance<br>philosophy stated |
| <b># &amp; type of restaurants (operating)</b>      | <b>7.5</b><br>4 distinct outlets                                                                                       | <b>7.5</b><br>two counted here                                                                                              | <b>7.5</b><br>three strong<br>venues                                         | <b>6.5</b><br>fewer outlets<br>overall                      |
| <b>Signature dishes/ingredients (menu evidence)</b> | <b>9.0</b><br>USDA Prime &<br>Kagoshima programs;<br>dish-level detail<br>published                                    | <b>8.0</b><br>Tea/tasting sets<br>detailed; others<br>lighter                                                               | <b>8.5</b><br>ENYE<br>menus/releases;<br>Azure<br>grill/teppan               | <b>8.5</b><br>recognizable Thai<br>signatures               |
| <b>Recent public venue-level rating signals</b>     | <b>9.6</b><br><b>Palermo 4.8/5</b>                                                                                     | <b>7.5</b><br>hotel/venue signals<br>(not chain-uplifted)                                                                   | <b>8.0</b><br>venue signals<br>available                                     | <b>9.0</b><br>strong venue<br>signals for<br>Benjarong      |
| <b>Décor/theme fit (photo-verified)</b>             | <b>8.0</b><br>interiors match<br>concepts                                                                              | <b>8.0</b><br>décor aligns with<br>concepts                                                                                 | <b>8.5</b><br>rooms fit themes                                               | <b>8.5</b><br>formal Thai room                              |
| <b>Cuisine composite</b>                            | <b>8.7</b>                                                                                                             | <b>7.8</b>                                                                                                                  | <b>8.3</b>                                                                   | <b>8.2</b>                                                  |

**Why:** Palermo's documented methods and your **4.8/5** venue rating lift Plantation Bay to the top on cuisine. Shangri-La's breadth is treated as **Chinese + buffet** given the seafood fine-dining room's variable status.

### 3) Rooms (Weight 20%) — weighted sub-scores per your rubric

**Size→score rule:** 30 m<sup>2</sup> = 5.0; 50 m<sup>2</sup> = 10.0 (linear).

**Base sizes used:** PB ≈46 m<sup>2</sup>; SL ≈34 m<sup>2</sup> (Main Wing Deluxe); CR ≈36 m<sup>2</sup>; DU ≈32 m<sup>2</sup>.

**Floorplans credit only where clearly published.**

| Sub-criterion<br>(weight)                                       | Plantation Bay                                                | Shangri-La                                                                        | Crimson    | Dusit      |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|------------|
| Base room size<br>(30%)                                         | <b>9.0</b>                                                    | <b>6.0</b>                                                                        | <b>6.5</b> | <b>5.5</b> |
| Floorplan/layout<br>clarity (10%)                               | <b>10.0</b> — per-type<br>sizes/layout logic<br>clearly shown | <b>0.0</b> — no public<br>floorplans                                              | <b>0.0</b> | <b>0.0</b> |
| Interior furnishings<br>& materials (10%)                       | <b>7.5</b>                                                    | <b>7.0</b>                                                                        | <b>8.0</b> | <b>7.5</b> |
| Bath size &<br>fixtures (20%)<br>(sep. tub/shower;<br>counters) | <b>* 6.5</b>                                                  | <b>7.5</b>                                                                        | <b>7.5</b> | <b>7.0</b> |
| Balcony/patio<br>usability (10%)                                | <b>8.5</b> — true patios<br>by lagoons                        | <b>3.0</b> — many balconies<br>≈1 m deep; many<br>stacks face<br>parking/internal | <b>8.0</b> | <b>5.0</b> |
| Views & access to<br>facilities (20%)                           | <b>9.0</b> — low-rise<br>ring around water                    | <b>6.5</b> — long<br>corridors/multi-wing;<br>mixed views                         | <b>7.0</b> | <b>6.0</b> |
| <b>Rooms composite<br/>(0–10)</b>                               | <b>8.1</b>                                                    | <b>5.9</b>                                                                        | <b>7.2</b> | <b>6.0</b> |

**\*Plantation Bay disagrees with this grade, since our bathrooms are demonstrably larger and better-equipped than the others, with a larger bathroom area, separate tub and shower, 5-mode shower, hygienic washlet vs. unsanitary handheld anal sprays in all the others, and greater counter space.**

**Notes:** PB gets full **floorplan** credit; Shangri-La is penalized for shallow/parking-facing balcony prevalence and lack of public plan sets; Dusit’s tower circulation adds friction; Crimson’s base rooms are competent with stronger villa stock beyond the base category.

#### 4) Leisure activities (Weight 20%) — scuba/snorkel & island hops prioritized

| Sub-criterion                                                                                      | Plantation Bay                                                                                             | Shangri-La                                       | Crimson    | Dusit      |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|------------|------------|
| Proximity to marquee snorkel/dive anchors (Hilutungan, Nalusuan, Marigondon Wall/Cave/“Cathedral”) | <b>9.2</b> — closest approach; south-Mactan sites on the doorstep; short banca runs to Hilutungan/Nalusuan |                                                  |            |            |
| House-reef / easy shore-snorkel from property                                                      | <b>8.5</b> — on-property reef front & dive jetty                                                           | <b>9.0</b> — sanctuary snorkeling from beach     | <b>7.6</b> | <b>7.2</b> |
| On-site dive center / fleet                                                                        | <b>9.0</b> — established PADI 5-Star at PB                                                                 | <b>8.8</b> — in-house sea-sports/diving          | <b>8.0</b> | <b>7.6</b> |
| Secondary activities & city access (CCLEX)                                                         | <b>8.8</b> — archery, indoor range, bikes; <b>CCLEX</b> gives fastest city access                          | <b>8.2</b> — kids/arcade/tennis; longer city run | <b>8.0</b> | <b>7.5</b> |
| <b>Leisure composite (0–10)</b>                                                                    | <b>9.1</b>                                                                                                 | <b>8.4</b>                                       | <b>7.9</b> | <b>7.3</b> |

**Why:** PB combines **diving proximity** (Marigondon wall/cave & “cathedral”) with quick island-hop access and the **CCLEX** city connection; Shangri-La remains excellent for on-beach snorkelling inside its sanctuary.

## 5) Spa (Weight 20%) — mapped/footprint-based; no map or published facilities = deduction

| Sub-criterion                                    | Plantation Bay — Mogambo Springs                                                  | Shangri-La — CHI, The Spa                             | Crimson — Aum Spa                                                             | Dusit — Namm Spa                             |
|--------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| Dedicated land area / stand-alone evidence       | <b>9.8</b> — <b>≈5,000 m<sup>2</sup></b> spa village; clearly shown on resort map | <b>6.0</b> — no objective footprint or map ID         | <b>6.8</b> — existence/photos yes; <b>no site map placement</b>               | <b>6.5</b> — integrated; area N/A            |
| Thematic style & interiors (photo-verified)      | <b>9.0</b> — Japanese-inspired village rooms, water features                      | <b>7.0</b> — CHI aesthetic; sparse facility specifics | <b>7.5</b> — contemporary rooms/cabanas                                       | <b>6.8</b> — generic Thai-brand room styling |
| Range of treatments (published)                  | <b>8.5</b> — broad body/scrub/soak menus                                          | <b>7.5</b>                                            | <b>7.5</b>                                                                    | <b>7.0</b>                                   |
| Wet-area facilities (sauna/steam/hot/cold pools) | <b>8.5</b> — hot/cold/thalassic pools, needle shower, sauna/steam documented      | <b>6.8</b> — facilities not fully specified           | <b>7.0</b> — sauna + outdoor Jacuzzi stated; full circuit <b>not</b> detailed | <b>6.6</b> — minimal detail                  |
| <b>Spa composite (0–10)</b>                      | <b>9.2</b>                                                                        | <b>6.9</b>                                            | <b>7.4</b>                                                                    | <b>6.7</b>                                   |

**Why:** PB is the only resort with a **clearly published large-scale spa footprint**; CHI lacks map/area evidence; Aum cannot be located on a site plan (deducted); Namm’s facilities list is thin.

## Weighted Overall (5 sections × 20%)

| Hotel         | Plantation Bay    | Crimson Mactan | Shangri-La Mactan | Dusit Thani Mactan |
|---------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| Beach (20%)   | 9.1 → <b>1.82</b> | 7.6 → 1.52     | 7.3 → 1.46        | 6.5 → 1.30         |
| Cuisine (20%) | 8.7 → <b>1.74</b> | 8.3 → 1.66     | 7.8 → 1.56        | 8.2 → 1.64         |
| Rooms (20%)   | 8.1 → <b>1.62</b> | 7.2 → 1.44     | 5.9 → 1.18        | 6.0 → 1.20         |
| Leisure (20%) | 9.1 → <b>1.82</b> | 7.9 → 1.58     | 8.4 → 1.68        | 7.3 → 1.46         |
| Spa (20%)     | 9.2 → <b>1.84</b> | 7.4 → 1.48     | 6.9 → 1.38        | 6.7 → 1.34         |
| Overall /10   | <b>8.8</b>        | <b>7.7</b>     | <b>7.3</b>        | <b>6.9</b>         |

---

## Bottom-line summary

- **Overall winner: Plantation Bay (8.8/10)** — Highest real-world **water usability**, **shortest room-to-water distances**, **mapped 5,000 m² spa village**, closest approach to marquee dive/snorkel anchors, and CCLEX advantage for city errands.
- **Runner-up: Crimson (7.7/10)** — Strong trio of dining venues (ENYE/Azure/Saffron), competent rooms (villas notable), balanced leisure—just smaller in capacity and a step farther from the classic island-hop triangle.

- **Shangri-La (7.3/10):** Excellent snorkel-from-the-beach sanctuary and multiple outlets, but hotel-block massing, shallow/parking-facing balconies, and lack of floorplans/clear spa footprint pull scores down.
- **Dusit (6.9/10):** Pleasant infinity-pool waterfront and a standout Thai flagship (Benjarong), yet beach capacity and tower circulation limit day-to-day resort usability.

## Fit by traveler type

- **Families with children: Plantation Bay** — walk-to-water rooms, huge lagoon capacity, many kid-friendly activities.
- **Romancing couples: Crimson** (ENYE + Azure vibe) or **Plantation Bay** (privacy + spa village).
- **Three-generation families: Plantation Bay** — capacity and short distances reduce logistics friction.
- **Seniors & retirees: Plantation Bay** — minimal gradients, patios at water's edge, faster city access via CCLEX.